The Privacy Dilemma

Overview

In this lesson students consider and discuss the trade-offs we all make on a daily basis between maintaining our privacy, and gaining access to information services. The lesson begins with a series of guided questions to help students assess their own perceptions of privacy and determine their comfort levels with giving out personal information. This is followed by a series of exercises and case studies that encourage them to delve deeper into privacy issues. As a summative activity, students produce short video essays that reflect those privacy issues they consider to be important.

Learning Outcomes

Students will:

- learn about the risks of giving out personal information online
- consider and debate the importance of privacy relative to other concerns, such as security and access to online services
- understand the possible consequences of posting photos, personal information and messages
- become aware of the distinction between privacy and security
- form and express opinions
- create a media product

Preparation and Materials

Review these backgrounder:

- Advertising, marketing, and consumerism and children/youth online (http://mediasmarts.ca/privacy/advertising-marketing-consumerism-children-youth-online)

Photocopy these handouts:

- Case Study One
- Case Study Two
- Case Study Three
• Thinking About Privacy
• Student Tool Kit: Creating a Video Essay
• Storyboards for the Production

If students do not have access to computers during the lesson, print and copy these online overviews from the myprivacy.mychoice.mylife website:


Procedure

Perceptions of Privacy

Begin by asking students how important their privacy is to them. (You may ask them to rate it on a scale of one to five, with one being a very low priority and five being a very high priority.) Ask those who say it is unimportant why they are not concerned. (They may feel that they have nothing to hide, that nobody is interested in violating their privacy, or that privacy is over-rated.) Ask students to give specific examples of real or feared violations of their privacy, which you may compile on the blackboard.

Using the examples raised by students, have the class try to define what is meant by “privacy.” Is it an absolute (you either have privacy or you don’t) or a relative thing (you can have more or less privacy)? Is privacy more important in some contexts than others (online vs. offline, at home vs. at school, etc.)?

Privacy Poll

If computers are available, have students go online to visit and read the mychoice and myprivacy everyday sections of the myprivacy.mychoice.mylife website. (If computers are not available, distribute printouts of these sections to students.)

As they do this, have them complete the following questions (these questions are repeated on the Thinking About Privacy handout at the end of this document):

- On the list of events in myprivacy everyday, how many might apply to you?
- Of the events on that list, which seem like justifiable losses of privacy, and which do not seem justified? For example, are the advantages of photo radar (10:30 AM) worth the loss of privacy it involves?
- Give two examples of information about you that may be collected automatically whenever you visit a website.
- Read the list of ways we’re prompted to voluntarily give up personal information online. How many of these have you responded to?
- List two things about e-mail that make it less private than postal mail.
- How does spam affect your privacy?
- What is the difference between a bot and a virus?
• Read the list from the mychoice section entitled “What can I do about it?” Choose the three tips you think are most useful to you, and briefly explain why you chose each one.

• How important is privacy to you? If it IS a concern, what specific aspects of privacy loss worry you? If it’s NOT a concern for you, explain why not.

Once students have finished their questionnaires, discuss their answers as a class, in particular responses to the final question. Have answers changed since the first class discussion? If so, have students become more, or less, worried about their privacy? Why?

Case Studies

Distribute the three Case Study handouts randomly, so that each student gets only one of the three. Give students time to read their case study and answer the questions. Once this has been done ask those students who read the same study to summarize the events involved and the privacy issues that were raised. As a class discuss the three case studies. Are the issues relevant to them? Are they likely to change in the future as our society becomes more and more dependent on the Internet? What, if anything, should citizens and/or government do about them?

Based on what they’ve learned, ask students to reflect on and discuss what they feel are the most serious privacy issues in their own lives.

Video Essay

Divide students into groups of two or three, and have them research and create a video essay on the privacy issue of their choice. It should cover key points relating to the chosen issue, and make a persuasive point. The video should be no longer than a minute or two long (60-120 seconds). (If making a video is not technically feasible, students should either perform a skit or write a short essay with the same requirements.)

To help students make the videos, distribute the handout Student Tool Kit: Creating a Video Essay. Review “The Pre-Production Phase” section, and explain that careful planning is the key to making a good video. Talk them through the section entitled “Start with a plan,” and then go through the “Have a script” section. Direct each group to write the script; once it’s written, have them rehearse it to make sure it fits the allotted time frame.

Review the “Create a storyboard” section with the class, and have each group create a storyboard and a shot list for their video. Check and approve each group’s work, then schedule rehearsals (both with and without actual cameras). In some cases, the storyboards and shot lists may have to be adjusted based on rehearsal results.

(During rehearsals, remind students to be aware of the material in the “Respect bystanders and copyright” section, covering aspects such as scenes of conflict and visible trademarks.)

When the groups have finished rehearsing, review with them “The Production Phase” section of the Creating a Video Essay handout. Have each group shoot their video, following their storyboard and shot list.

Finally, review “The Post-production Phase” section and have students edit first the individual segments of their videos, and then the segments together as a whole. As a class, host a “myprivacy & me” video festival of the student’s productions.
Additional Resources for Teachers and Students

In addition to the information and resources that are available on the myprivacy.mychoice.mylife website, the free online Lesson Library of MediaSmarts contains several other lessons that address the issue of privacy management. These include:

**Online Marketing to Kids: Protecting Your Privacy** (Grades 6-9)
http://mediasmarts.ca/lessonplan/online-marketing-kids-protecting-your-privacy-lesson

**What Students Need to Know about Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy** (Grades 5 and 10)

**Who Knows? Your Privacy in the Information Age** (Grades 8-10)
http://mediasmarts.ca/lessonplan/who-knows-your-privacy-information-age-lesson

**Privacy in the Information Age** (Grades 11-12)
http://mediasmarts.ca/lessonplan/privacy-information-age-lesson
Case Study One

Rick, a Grade 10 student, notices as he gets to school that the front entrance now has a security camera, which is held inside a protective plastic bubble. As he goes to the cafeteria to get a snack before class he sees that cameras have been installed there, too – one in the ceiling and one right over the line for the cash register.

He decides to ask his homeroom teacher, Ms. Ellison, about the cameras. Ms. Ellison sighs and says they were put in because of an increase in graffiti, and of shoplifting in the cafeteria. She tells Rick that she’s taught in some schools where every hallway had a security camera. Some schools, she’s heard, even have cameras in all the classrooms.

Though he can’t quite explain why, Rick is disturbed by the thought of being on camera all the time. Now that he’s aware of them, he starts to notice all of the other cameras in public places. Nearly every store he goes into, and all the corridors at the mall, have security cameras; busy intersections have red light cameras; police cars have dashboard cameras that film everything in front of their cars. He thinks about photos he’s posted to Facebook, and about the webcam he has in his room: is he sure he knows where those pictures go?

Rick has to do a project on a current issue for his class with Ms. Ellison, and he decides to do it on cameras in public places. As he starts doing research he learns that many cities are installing cameras for the police to use; these are already widespread in the United Kingdom, and big cities like New York and Chicago are putting them in buses, subway stations and parks. Reading a few newspaper articles on the subject shows him that while some people are worried about losing their privacy many other people think that the cameras are a good thing if they prevent crime. One article says that scientists are working to write software that will let cameras recognize sounds like gunshots and glass breaking.

The next week Rick presents his project to the class. He’s taken a map of his neighbourhood and marked on it everywhere there’s a camera of some kind. He points out to the class that the map came from Google Maps, which provides real satellite photos so detailed you can see individual people (though the faces are blurred.) He says that about the only place you can be sure of being off camera is in your own home or in the classroom (and, if Ms. Ellison is right, there may be soon be cameras in classrooms).

Ms. Ellison asks the class if anyone has any questions, and several of Rick’s friends put up their hands. They’re not asking questions, though: they’re showing him that they’ve filmed him with their camera phones.

Questions

1. Briefly summarize the events in this case study and list the issues it raises around privacy. (You should be able to identify at least three issues.)
2. How serious do you think the issues raised here are? Why? Which is the most serious and why?
3. Does this case study seem relevant to your own life? Why or why not?
Case Study Two

Jillian, a Grade 12 student, does most of her shopping online. So much of her time is taken up by her classes, extra-curricular activities, and the part-time job she has to save money for university that she just doesn’t have time to set foot in a mall or a store. Besides, online shopping is so convenient! She can order clothes, cosmetics and especially books. In fact, every time she goes to Congo.com they have a page of recommended books for her. She’s impressed by how good their recommendations have been, and they just seem to get more accurate the more books she buys.

When she has a little time to relax, Jillian likes to flake out and read cheesy magazines. She was able to get a cheap subscription to her favourite ones through Congo.com, and she’s signed up to be able to read more for free online. The only problem is that lately she’s started getting all kinds of junk mail, both spam and postal mail. She’s even getting telemarketing calls at home, and spam text messages on her cell phone! She asks her mother about it and her mother says the magazine publisher probably sold her name to other companies.

Jillian starts thinking about all of the advertising she sees when she’s online. She’d never noticed before how much the advertisers seem to know about her – she’s always seeing ads for dating services that promise to introduce her to boys in her town, for instance. Even when she goes to websites that have nothing to do with shopping, they’re full of banner ads and pop-ups for the kinds of things she buys online. As an experiment, she decides to add “Skateboarding” to her list of hobbies on her social networking profile. Sure enough, within hours she’s seeing ads for skate magazines on the websites she visits.

She decides to go to Congo.com and read their privacy policy. It says that they won’t give out her personal information if she doesn’t want them to, but she has to say she doesn’t want them to, and they never asked when she signed up for her account. It also says that they have no control over what the companies that actually print the books and magazines will do with her information. It also says that they may gather information about her from other sites to improve their recommendations to her.

Jillian isn’t sure what to do. She doesn’t want to stop using Congo.com, or take down her social networking profile, but she feels uncomfortable giving out any more personal information. She worries, too, when she sees her younger sister signing up for websites she visits. A lot of them also have surveys that ask for more personal information about yourself and your family. By the time she is Jillian’s age, how much will advertisers know about her?

Questions

1. Briefly summarize the events in this case study and list the issues it raises around privacy. (You should be able to identify at least three issues.)
2. How serious do you think the issues raised here are? Why? Which is the most serious and why?
3. Does this case study seem relevant to your own life? Why or why not?
Case Study Three

Jared, a Grade 9 student, is surprised on Monday morning to be called into the principal's office. He's even more surprised when the principal tells him he's being suspended because of photos that were posted online.

It all started at a party that weekend. Someone took a picture (with a camera phone) of Jared drinking a can of something – it's impossible to read the label – and posted it on a photo-sharing site, captioned with "Jared gets his drunk on." Other people in the party photos are clearly drinking beer, so when the principal saw the photos he decided to suspend everyone in them that he recognized. He also decided to take Jared off the Student Council for setting a bad example.

Jared objects to this: there's no proof that he was drinking in the photo, and he didn't write the caption. Besides, what he does outside of school shouldn't affect his school life. The principal points out that teachers are expected to behave themselves outside of school – the school board recommends that teachers not even have Facebook profiles, and some teachers in other cities have lost their jobs because of things they've posted – so it's fair to hold students to the same standard.

When he gets home, Jared looks for the photo online. He finds it, but can't remove it; because it was posted anonymously he can't even ask the person who posted it to remove it. He also finds out that the photo was tagged with his full name: it's the first thing that comes up when he does a Google search for himself. He wonders if it will still be online when he starts applying for universities or looking for a job.

Jared's mother is furious when she hears about the suspension. She's angry at Jared for going to the party, but also angry at the school and at whoever posted the photo. She contacts the company that runs the photo-sharing site and asks them to remove it, but they say they don't have any legal reason to interfere with one of their users' accounts. She makes Jared phone everyone who was at the party and ask if they were the ones who posted the photo. Finally his friend Mark – who wasn't suspended, because he wasn't in any of the photos – admits that he did it and agrees to take down the photos. Jared's mother then does another Google search for Jared's name, and the picture is gone. When she does an image search, though, the photo and caption still appear in the search results.

Questions

1. Briefly summarize the events in this case study and list the issues it raises around privacy. (You should be able to identify at least three issues.)
2. How serious do you think the issues raised here are? Why? Which is the most serious and why?
3. Does this case study seem relevant to your own life? Why or why not?
Thinking About Privacy

As you read the mychoice and myprivacy everyday sections of the myprivacy.mychoice.mylife website, answer the following questions:

1. On the list of events in myprivacy everyday, how many might apply to you?
   _____________________________________________________________
   _____________________________________________________________

2. Of the events on that list, which seem like justifiable losses of privacy, and which do not seem justified? For example, are the advantages of photo radar (10:30 AM) worth the loss of privacy it involves?
   _____________________________________________________________
   _____________________________________________________________

3. Give two examples of personal information that may be collected automatically when you visit a website.
   _____________________________________________________________
   _____________________________________________________________

4. Read the list of ways in which we choose to give up personal information online. How many of these have you responded to?
   _____________________________________________________________
   _____________________________________________________________

5. List two things about e-mail that make it less private than postal mail.
   _____________________________________________________________
   _____________________________________________________________

6. How is spam related to privacy?
   _____________________________________________________________
   _____________________________________________________________
7. What is the difference between a bot and a virus?
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

8. Read the list from the mychoice section titled “What can I do about it?” Choose the three tips that you think are most relevant and useful to you, and briefly explain why you chose each one.
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

9. How important is privacy to you? If privacy is a concern, what are some specific aspects of your privacy that you’re worried about?
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
Student Tool Kit: Creating a Video Essay

A video essay, just like a written essay, explores a topic and makes a persuasive point about it. Its style can range from simple or as complex as you wish: edited or unedited, with music or voice-over, or without. It can be created on a cell phone, a video camera, a webcam, or any other video device.

The Pre-Production Phase

Start with a plan

First, ask yourself some basic questions about your project:

- What’s the message you want to convey?
- What visual and technical elements, such as sound or camera angles, will help to get your message across?
- What other elements may affect your message? Things to consider include location, people, and props. If these are key to your design, it may be a wise idea to plan your ideas around these elements.

Have a script

Once you’ve worked out the details of your message, and thought about how to get it across to your audience, it’s time to commit your ideas to paper. Your script should identify how the images and audio (dialogue, sound, music) will fit together.

Create a storyboard

When your script is ready, the next step is a storyboard. (Don’t worry about making your drawings look really good! Many talented filmmakers create very simple pictures). Storyboards are important for many reasons:

- They help you solidify the mental images you want to capture. The process of creating a storyboard forces you to focus on each sequence, shot, camera angle and camera movement. (For details, see the “Camera shots” in The Production Phase section of this handout.)
- They make an excellent communication tool, allowing you to show others (such as the people who are working with you) exactly how you want the story to unfold. Words can cause confusion and leave listeners unclear about your intentions; pictures are much easier to understand.
- They simplify the order in which you choose to shoot your project, allowing you to note which shots are similar enough to be covered by the same camera position.

Make up a shot list

Your shot list is the order in which you plan to shoot your essay. List your shots not in chronological order but according to location, and match the ones that have a similar set-up. For example, if your storyboard shows that shots 4, 9 and 15 are all close-ups of someone sitting in the same place; all three shots could be recorded one after the other.
Prepare your technical needs

List the things you’ll need for your sound effects, props, costumes and equipment. Make sure the batteries for your equipment are fully charged. Have extras of everything on hand: batteries, extension cords and power bars, electrical and masking tape, and videotape (if you’re recording in that format).

Review your camera’s operating manual. Before shooting day, make sure you’re familiar with the key functions you’ll need, and get some practice using the camera. Keep the manual with you, just in case you need to troubleshoot. Also, familiarize yourself with any mechanical quirks the camera may have. Some cameras, for instance, automatically roll back the tape just a bit when you stop recording, so you lose some footage.

Choose your location(s)

Whether you decide to film in a public place or a private one, you need to consider technical issues and/or permission issues.

- Be sure you have permission to film at your chosen location. If it’s your school, for instance, you’ll need permission from a teacher or principal. If it’s a business or a private home, you must get permission from the owner. If it’s a park or a public location, you may need to get a city permit. If that’s the case, your teacher can help you.

- If your location is indoors, check in advance for the accessibility, location and number of electrical outlets. Make sure you have enough power for all your equipment.

- Check the ambient light and sound at your location. Are there any elements that will distort your sound, such as a water fountain, traffic, a humming ceiling fan, construction going on? Will you need to bring extra lights to illuminate your scene(s) properly?

- If you plan to film outdoors, pay close attention to the weather forecast. You may need to change your shooting day to accommodate the weather.

- If you have a crew of people helping you, let them know well in advance when and where you’ll be filming. Make sure they know what their roles will be.

- Have your production notes with you at all times. They’ll keep you on track while shooting.

Respect bystanders and copyright

Your scene(s) should not include any physical conflict, violence or weapons. If you plan to shoot a tense scene involving arguments, emotional distress or staged injuries, take extra precautions in a public place. You may need to post a public notice, notify city authorities, get a special permit, or even have professionals standing by. If you plan such a scenario, have your teacher help.

People who appear on camera should avoid clothes with logos or brand names, as these are copyrighted images.

The Production Phase
Camera shots

Every film, whether short or long, is made up of thousands of shots, all of which must be carefully planned by the director. Here’s a brief introduction to the various types of shots, involving different aspects of the camera.

**Camera Distance.** Depending on how far the camera is from its subject, the three main types of shots are close-up, medium shot, and long shot.

- A **close-up** shows only one part of the subject, usually in great detail: a person’s face, a car’s licence plate, a hand on a doorbell.
- A **medium shot** shows roughly half of the subject: a character from the waist up, or the back end of a car.
- A **long shot** shows the whole subject: a person from head to foot, or the entire car.

Other kinds of shots are the “establishing shot,” used at the beginning of a scene to give viewers an idea of where they are. For example, a long shot of the school’s façade, or of City Hall, establishes the fact that the story takes place at those locations.

During a conversation, or a scene involving more than one person, a “reaction shot” is used to show the effect of one person’s actions on the other character(s).

**Camera Angle.** The angle from which a director chooses to shoot gives audiences some subtle clues about a scene.

- A “high-angle” shot positions the camera above eye level, looking down on the subject. Depending on how extreme the angle is, this makes the subject look small, insignificant, weak or helpless.
- An “eye level” shot gives a neutral, factual impression.
- A “low-angle” shot positions the camera looking up at the subject from below. This angle makes the subject appear important, powerful or dominating.
- A “reverse-angle” shot positions the camera as if it were the subject’s own eyes. So rather than looking **at** the subject, the camera shows what the subject sees.

**Camera Moves.** A camera isn’t a fixed observer; it can also move in and out of the action. When the camera moves left or right, it’s called “tracking” (sometimes also known as “trucking”). Moving forward or backward is known as “dollying.”

When the camera stays in the same position and turns left or right, it’s called “panning,” and turning up or down is “tilting.” Focusing can also make the camera appear to move closer to its subject or further away from it, by using the lens to “zoom” in or out.

All these camera moves are useful, but they should not be overused—or they’ll distract the audience and diminish the intended effect. Camera movements should always be planned and rehearsed ahead of time, so they’ll be smooth and in tune with the action.
Using your camera

If you’re not used to working with a video camera, it pays to keep a few guidelines in mind:

- When setting up for filming, it’s always wise to tape down extension cords and electrical wires. This prevents people from tripping over the cords, and either injuring themselves or unplugging or damaging the equipment.
- Check the lens periodically to make sure it’s free of dust and hair. When you stop recording, even briefly, put the lens cap back on.
- Every time you change location, do a “white balance”: zoom the camera in on a sheet of white paper, and use the camera’s automatic white balance setting. This ensures that the camera registers colours properly. Every location has its own idiosyncratic lighting and hues, and this helps you to compensate.
- Use a tripod for steady, professional-looking shots that are easier to match at the editing phase. (However, if your story needs a realistic feel, like a home video, a documentary footage or a police drama, you may prefer the slightly wobbly hand-held approach.) Practice all camera movements before you shoot. When you record, don’t stop until you’ve completed all the motions.
- Use manual focus. Although automatic focus ensures that everything is sharp, you risk losing your focus if there’s movement near the lens, or a change in lighting. To avoid these problems, set the camera to automatic focus to zoom in on your subject; then, once you’ve focused properly, switch to manual and zoom out again to re-establish your original framing.
- If your subject is moving across the frame or out of it, wait until she or he leaves the frame completely before you stop recording.
- Keep a log of all your shots. Include information such as shot number, duration of the shot, and whether you felt it was a good take. Again, this saves time during editing.
- Record longer versions of each shot than you think you’ll need. You can always edit a shot down in post-production, but you can’t make it longer.
- Take extra shots for “cutaways.” These come in handy during editing if you find you need some extra material to insert between sequences that don’t quite match up. An extra shot can be a close-up of a person, a prop or even just a hand movement. Also take some “establishing” shots of settings, such as an exterior of a building, to make it easy for your audience to identify the location.

Working with light

Knowing how to use lighting properly can help your project look really professional. Here are some “how-to” tips for creating good lighting.

- When it comes to natural light, trust your camera’s video display rather than your own eyes. Human eyes automatically adjust to light levels, which lenses can’t do. That’s why a bright sunny day appears clear and crisp to our eyes, but on film it looks overexposed and washed-out. If you’re shooting outside in daylight, it’s best to do it when the sun isn’t directly overhead.
• Avoid windows during interior shots, since the bright light from outside will make it hard to see your subject. Never place your subject between a window and your camera. If you’re shooting in daylight, you may need to cover the windows and turn on some artificial lights.

• The main light used to illuminate your subject is called the “key light.” It’s usually the most intense light in the set-up, and should be placed at a forty-five degree angle to both your subject and the camera.

• The “fill light” is a secondary light used to offset any shadows created by the key light. For that reason, it should be placed on the opposite side of the camera from the key light.

• A “back light,” pointed at your subject from behind, distinguishes your subject from the background.

![Lighting Diagram]

**Working with sound**

Sound is extremely important, since audiences are often more ready to forgive poor-quality video than bad sound. To get the best sound possible, follow these tips:

• If you place your subject too close to the microphone, the sound will be too loud, or may sound distorted or cracked. If you use an independent recorder and have those problems, then your levels are too high.

• If you place your subject too far away from the microphone, the audio will be too soft, and will blend into the background noise. The sound will be unusable during editing.

• If you record some background sound on location, it can often be useful in helping to fill in gaps in the soundtrack at the editing phase.

**The Post-Production Phase**

**Editing**

Editing is a complex process that involves turning your raw material into a polished final product. Fortunately, new technology—such as specialized editing software—has made the process relatively simple. The computerized tools you use will define some of your options, but here are some general tips on editing:

• Give yourself a lot of time. You’ve worked hard to get your project to this point, and you don’t want to be rushed during the important final phase.
• Make sure your computer has enough space for all your project files: original footage, extra files such as sound or music, and your final version. Video production is a space-gobbler, and can easily overload your system. If disk space is limited, edit the project piece by piece, using only the footage you need to work on at any one time.

• Keep your story simple, and don’t be tempted to include a shot just because it’s interesting or was hard to get. Keep your focus on the story. Remember, the final product should only be 60–120 seconds long, so don’t spend too much time on fancy transitions or special effects.

• If things aren’t working well, try experimenting a little. Sometimes just changing sequences around can enhance or clarify your story.

When it comes to adding in background sound, don’t get carried away. You want your sound effects to enhance the scene, not to distract the audience. (Don’t turn the volume up too high, for example.) If you want to use background music, you may need to create the music yourself, or with friends, to avoid paying royalties. Failing that, use royalty-free music.